

The Los Angeles 100% Renewable Energy Study

# Advisory Group

### Meeting #10

December 5, 2019







Agenda

- Call to Order
- Introductions
- All LA100 Scenarios, Input Models \*\*
- SB100 Scenario, Bulk Power Models \*\*
- Lunch
- SB100 Scenario, Distribution Models \*\*
- All LA100 Scenarios, Output Models \*\*
- LA100 Final Run Updates \*\*
- Wrap-up and Next Steps

\*\*Q&A and Discussion

### Tips for Productive Discussions

...





Let one person speak at a time Help to make sure everyone gets equal time to give input

Keep input concise so others have time to participate



Actively listen to others, seek to understand perspectives Offer ideas to address questions and concerns raised by others



Hold questions until after presentations

LA100 | 4



The Los Angeles 100% Renewable Energy Study

### Initial Run Results: Overview of Today

Jaquelin Cochran, Ph.D. December 5, 2019





### Today's Plan: Use "Initial Run" to Walk through These Questions

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar

Main scenario model

### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

## Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis



### What are the impacts?



Environmental analysis

LA100 | 6

### Input Models (Paul Denholm)

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar

Main scenario model

#### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis

Impact models

## What are the impacts?



Environmental analysis

LA100 | 7

### Bulk Power & Distribution Models (Dan Steinberg, Bryan Palmintier)

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar

Main scenario model

### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis

Impact models

## What are the impacts?



Environmental analysis

### Output and Validation Models (Dan Steinberg)

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar



#### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

## Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis



## What are the impacts?

- Economic and workforce analysis
- Environmental analysis

### Impact Models (Jaquelin Cochran)

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar



### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

### Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis



## What are the impacts?



 Environmental analysis

LA100 | 10

Today— Present Initial Run Results

2020 AG Meetings— Review Final Run



LA100 | 11

### LA100 Scenarios (updated September 2019)

		LA100 Scenarios								
			Moderate Load	Electrification		High Load Electrification (Load Modernization)				High Load
		SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	High Load Stress
	2030 RE Target	60%	100% Net R E	100% Net RE	100% Net RE	60%	100% Net RE	100% Net R E	100% Net R E	60%
	Compliance Year for 100%	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045
Technologies Eligible in the Compliance Year	Biomass Biogas Electricity to Fuel (e.g. H2) Fuel Cells Hydro - Existing Hydro - New Hydro - Upgrades Natural Gas Nuclear - Existing Nuclear - New Wind, Solar, Geo	Y Y Y Y N Y S Y N Y	No No Y Y N Y N Y N Y	Y Y Y N Y N N N Y	Y Y Y N N No N Y	Y Y Y Y N Y S Y N Y	No No Y Y N Y N Y N Y	Y Y Y Y N Y N N O N Y	Y Y Y N N No N Y	Y Y Y Y N Y <b>Yes</b> Y N Y
Repowering OTC	Haynes, Scattergood, Harbor	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
DG	Distributed Adoption	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate
RECS	Financial Mechanisms (RECS/Allowances)	Yes	Ν	Ν	Ν	Yes	Ν	Ν	N	Yes
Load	Energy Efficiency Demand Response Electrification	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	High High High	High High High	High High High	High High High	Moderate Moderate High
Transmission	New or Upgraded Transmission Allowed?	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors
WECC	WECC VRE Penetration	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate

## **Today's Focus:** One of Each Scenario Type (Final Run Includes <u>Both</u> Moderate and High Load Levels For Each Type)

		LA100 Scenarios								
			Moderate Load Electrification			High Load Electrification (Load Modernization)				High Load
		SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	High Load Stress
	2030 RE Target	60%	100% Net R E	100% Net RE	100% Net RE	60%	100% Net RE	100% Net R E	100% Net R E	60%
	Compliance Year for 100%	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045
	Biomass Biogas Electricity to Fuel (e.g. H2)	Y Y Y	No No Y	Y Y Y	Y Y Y	Y Y Y	No No Y	Y Y Y	Y Y Y	Y Y Y
Technologies Eligible in the Compliance Year	Fuel Cells Hydro - Existing Hydro - New Hydro - Ungrades	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y	Y Y N Y
	Natural Gas Nuclear - Existing Nuclear - New	Yes Y N	N Y N	N No N	N No N	Yes Y N	N Y N	N No N	N No N	Yes Y N
	Wind, Solar, Geo Storage	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y	Y Y
Repowering OTC	Haynes, Scattergood, Harbor	N	N	Ν	Ν	N	N	N	N	N
DG	Distributed Adoption	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate
RECS	Financial Mechanisms (RECS/Allowances)	Yes	N	N	N	Yes	N	N	N	Yes
Load	Energy Efficiency De mand Response Electrification	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	High High High	High High High	High High High	High High High	Moderate Moderate High
Transmission	New or Upgraded Transmission Allowed?	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Ne w Corridors Allowe d	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors
WECC	WECC VRE Penetration	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate

#### First: In-depth Focus on SB100 to Understand One Set of Results

		LA100 Scenarios								
			Moderate Load	Electrification		High Load Electrification (Load Modernization)				High Load
		SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	High Load Stress
	2030 RE Target	60%	100% Net R E	100% Net RE	100% Net RE	60%	100% Net RE	100% Net R E	100% Net R E	60%
	Compliance Year for 100%	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045
Technologies Eligible in the Compliance Year	Biomass Biogas Electricity to Fuel (e.g. H2) Fuel Cells Hydro - Existing Hydro - New Hydro - Upgrades Natural Gas Nuclear - Existing Nuclear - Existing Nuclear - New Wind, Solar, Geo Storage	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y Y	No No Y Y N Y N Y Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y Y	No No Y Y Y N Y N Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y N No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y Y
Repowering OTC	Haynes, Scattergood, Harbor	N	Ν	Ν	Ν	Ν	Ν	Ν	Ν	Ν
DG	Distributed Adoption	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate
RECS	Financial Mechanisms (RECS/Allowances)	Yes	N	Ν	Ν	Yes	Ν	Ν	Ν	Yes
Load	Energy Efficiency Demand Response Electrification	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	High High High	High High High	High High High	High High High	Moderate Moderate High
Transmission	New or Upgraded Transmission Allowed?	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors
WECC	WECC VRE Penetration	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate

#### Second: Review All Models to Assess Trends

		LA100 Scenarios								
			Moderate Load Electrification			High Load Electrification (Load Modernization)				High Load
		SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	SB100	LA-Leads, Emissions Free (No Biomass)	Transmission Renaissance	High Distributed Energy Future	High Load Stress
	2030 RE Target	60%	100% Net R E	100% Net RE	100% Net RE	60%	100% Net RE	100% Net R E	100% Net R E	60%
	Compliance Year for 100%	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045	2035/2040	2045	2045	2045
Technologies Eligible in the Compliance Year	Biomass Biogas Electricity to Fuel (e.g. H2) Fuel Cells Hydro - Existing Hydro - New Hydro - Upgrades Natural Gas Nuclear - Existing Nuclear - New Wind, Solar, Geo Storage	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y Y	No No Y Y N Y N Y N Y Y	Y Y Y N N No No Y Y	Y Y Y N Y N No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y Y	No No Y Y Y N Y N Y N Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y N No No Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y N <b>No</b> N Y Y	Y Y Y Y N Y Yes Y N Y
Repowering OTC	Haynes, Scattergood, Harbor	Ν	N	N	Ν	N	Ν	N	N	N
DG	Distributed Adoption	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate	High	Moderate
RECS	Financial Mechanisms (RECS/Allowances)	Yes	N	N	Ν	Yes	N	N	N	Yes
Load	Energy Efficiency Demand Response Electrification	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	Moderate Moderate Moderate	High High High	High High High	High High High	High High High	Moderate Moderate High
Transmission	New or Upgraded Transmission Allowed?	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors	New Corridors Allowed	No New Transmission	Only Along Existing or Planned Corridors
WECC	WECC VRE Penetration	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate	Moderate

Important Considerations for Interpreting Initial Run Results Today's results will change for Final Run

- Electricity demand projections due to:
  - Higher electrification estimates (e.g., EVs, buses)
  - Higher electricity projections due to hotter temperatures
  - Demand response that can better manage extreme periods of stress
- Further analysis of reliability, particularly in the context of extreme conditions (long-duration transmission outages) and over multiple weather years
- Further consideration of non-variable renewable energy generation options for in-basin capacity
- Further consideration of the cost and constructability of both local solar and transmission assets

Why Are We Presenting Results That Will Change?

- We still can **learn general trends**, e.g., what types of investment may be required when in-basin thermal generation is not available, for example in the LA Leads scenario
- Reviewing current results enables the Advisory Group to better understand the LA100 modeling and provide feedback

How Will Today's Results Fit Into Overall Study Process?

- The Advisory Group uses the Initial Run results to:
  - Ask questions about what you are seeing
  - Better understand general trends and the broad technical challenges associated with achieving the 100% goal
  - Provide feedback on modeling approach, data, and assumptions (but less important is feedback on specific results, like costs, which will change)
- LA100 Study Team will incorporate learnings from today (e.g., what is unclear, which assumptions need updating) to incorporate into the Final Run

Initial Run (Today) vs. Final Run (to be presented at the March or June AG Meeting, depending on the model)

What's Included in Initial Run

What's Not Included Today but Will Be in Final Run

These slides are included with each set of modeling results to help communicate how the results will continue to change

### Follow-up Q&A from this Advisory Group Meeting

- Need time to digest and ask questions for the day?
- Like last two AGs, we will hold a webex-based Q&A after two weeks

• Mark your calendars for:

<u>Tuesday</u>, December 17, 2019 10:00 AM – 11:00 AM



The Los Angeles 100% Renewable Energy Study

### Initial Run Results: Input Models All LA100 Scenarios

Paul Denholm December 5, 2019





### Input Models

Input models

What is electricity demand and customer-driven supply?

- Electricity demand
- Demand response
- RE resource analysis
- Customer-driven solar

#### Main scenario model

### What should LADWP build?

- Generation
- Transmission
- Distribution upgrades

### Output and validation models

### How do we know it's right?

- Load balancing
- Resource adequacy
- Power flow and stability analysis
- Integrated distribution and transmission analysis



## What are the impacts?



• Environmental analysis



- 1. Electricity Demand Projections
- 2. Renewable Energy Resource Assessment
- 3. Customer-Driven Solar (Rooftop Photovoltaics)
- 4. Discussion/Q&A

### Electricity Demand Projections

Purpose within LA100 What will the demand for electricity be between now and 2045?

- Includes electricity demand from:
  - Residential and commercial buildings
  - Industrial and other loads
  - Electric vehicles
- Preliminary demand response also included, although these assumptions will change significantly for Final Run

### Initial Run (Today) vs. Final Run (March AG Presentation)

#### What's Included in Initial Run

Projections completed in January 2019

"High" projections that are lower than what we have in Final Run

#### What's Not Included Today but Will Be in Final Run

"High" efficiency and electrification projections that align with LA's Green New Deal Electric buses Climate-adjusted buildings demand Improved calibration of buildings models

More aggressive demand response

LA100 uses three projections of demand to indicate three different futures to assess how this affects pathways to meet 100% renewable energy:

- 1. Moderate: Modest increase in demand above 2017 IRP
- 2. High:
  - Initial Run (today): Higher than moderate
  - Final Run (March): Significant increase in demand due to high electrification of end uses, transportation
- **3. High Stress**: High electrification combined with low ("reference") energy-efficiency improvements

Residential and Commercial Electricity Demand How will residential and commercial buildings impact LADWP's need for new resources?

- How will the building stock change?
- What types of end uses will be electrified?
- How energy efficient will buildings and appliances be?
- What will the demand for electricity (heating, cooling, appliances, etc.) be at each hour of the day each year?





## Initial Run: Example Week of Residential Demand in Base Year



A100 | 30

### Buildings Demand: Coming in March AG Presentation

- Higher "high" electrification and efficiency projections that match LA's Green New Deal
- Hotter expected temperatures reflected in residential and commercial electricity demand
- Results that reflect additional calibration to ResStock and ComStock

Industrial Demand and Other Loads How will electricity demand change for major commercial and industrial customers?

- All industrial manufacturers
- Water system loads

- LAX

- Port of LA (including some electrification)
- Motion picture and video industry
- Unmetered outdoor lighting
- Owens Valley

Electric Vehicle Charging Demand

## How will electric vehicles and buses impact LADWP's need for new resources?

- How many cars will be electrified? What types of cars will they be (with what range)?
- How many miles do the drivers need to reach between charges?
- What type and where will the chargers be?
- When and for how long will the cars charge?
  - If drivers charge as soon as they arrive at home/work
  - If drivers can delay charging as long as possible

#### Share of Light-Duty Vehicles that are Electrified (Initial Run)



### Initial Run: EV Charging Simulations

Example from Initial Run: **High** (~2 million EVs)

Arrive and plug in: Significant charging demand during peak periods

Wait as long as possible to charge:

**Demand response:** Choose charging times within this window

Flexibility <u>helps</u> avoid the need for new capacity and better match demand with RE supply



## Transportation Demand: Coming in March AG Presentation

- Electric buses: 100% electrification of LADOT, LA Metro, school
- Higher "high" EV projections that are closer to LA's Green New Deal
  - 80% stock in 2045, which would yield 100% stock by 2055

### Demand Projections— All Sectors

### Initial Run: Annual Electricity Demand Projections (All Sectors)

Peak Day: Summer



weather data

Demand Response Where can demand response help match demand to renewable supply and avoid the need for expensive peaking capacity?

- What is the potential for demand to be shifted or deferred?
- How well does this potential align with when renewables are available or not available?

### Demand Response Programs

#### Interruptible Load

- Commercial, Institutional, and Industrial (CII, modeled on current program)
- Critical Peak Pricing (starting by 2030)

#### **Energy-Shifting**

- Generalized Summer Shift Program (also CII)
- Residential Cooling (based on programmable communicating thermostats)
- Schedulable Electric Vehicle Charging
- Residential Hot Water and Heating
- Commercial Cooling and Heating

Modeled in all Scenarios (Moderate, High, High Load Stress)



### Initial Run Demand Response: Interruptible Load



### Initial Run Demand Response: Energy Shifting



### Demand Response: Coming in March AG Presentation

- More detailed characterization of demand response resources
- Explore new sources for demand response

### Questions Related to Loads?

### Renewable Energy Resource Assessment

Purpose within LA100 Where are the most cost-effective renewable resources that can meet LADWP's need for new resources?

- Where are the best renewable energy resources?
- If you build generation plants, what are the generation profiles over the course of a year? Over 10 years?
- Where are the best locations relative to existing transmission?

#### What's Included in Initial Run

Renewable resource assessments for all technologies across the West (one weather year)

#### What's Not Included Today but Will Be in Final Run

10 years of renewable resource profiles for wind and solar

### Process for Creating Renewable Generation Profiles

Inputs:

- Weather data
- Land characteristics
- Biomass, hydro, and geothermal resource availability
- Renewable plant operating characteristics



### Process for Creating Renewable Generation Profiles



#### Utility-Scale PV Resource



LA100 | 50

### Utility-Scale PV Resource: Southern California



California Wind Resource: Including Offshore



#### Western U.S. Wind Resource



## Resource Assessment: Coming in March AG Presentation

- Repeat exercise for 10 years of data to include in analyses of resource adequacy (i.e., how confident are we that we have enough renewable generation to meet load?)
- Generate multiple years of forecasts and sub-hourly data sets

#### Questions Related to Renewable Resource Estimates?

Customer-Driven Solar (Rooftop Photovoltaics) Purpose within LA100 What will be the customer-driven demand for rooftop solar? How will this affect what LADWP needs to build (renewable energy; distribution upgrades)?

- Goal: Create two projections that represent realistic adoption rates:
  - 1. Moderate projections (based on lower compensation of net billing)
  - 2. High projections (based on higher compensation of net metering)
- Purpose is not to evaluate policy (net billing vs. net metering) but to create two different customer adoption trends



#### What's Included in Initial Run

Customer projections for rooftop solar

#### What's Not Included Today But Will Be in Final Run

Local ground-mounted and carport solar Local storage (customer and utility-scale) Changes to rooftop solar estimates based on changes to demand

Further calibration to the dGen model

### Initial Run – Quick Recap of Methods

# How much rooftop solar will customers adopt?



### Rooftop Solar: Framework for Projecting Adoption



- Technical potential: Maximum feasible amount of capacity
- Economic potential: For which customers is rooftop solar cost effective?
- **Deployment**: Of the above, who might adopt?

### Assess Rooftop Suitability for Solar



Deployment Estimate

Economic

Potential

### Rooftop Solar Generation

### Technical Potential



**Energy potential –** Annual generation per census block

#### **Rooftop Technical Potential Results**

- Approximately 10.5 GW<sub>DC</sub> of technical potential for rooftops in LADWP
- Most is in the **residential sector**, followed by manufacturing and commercial
- Nearly half is in census tracts designated as disadvantaged communities

Land Use	Dev. Land Use Bldgs (n)		Annual Gen. Potential (TWh)	Capacity Potential (GW)	
Airport	477	353,297	0.10	0.06	
Commercial	46,844	8,268,321	2.35	1.51	
Industrial	1,673	556,524	0.16	0.10	
Manufacturing	24,981	9,804,638	2.80	1.79	
Open Space	2,743	352,591	0.10	0.06	
Other	12,121	2,523,079	0.72	0.46	
Residential 738,438		35,439,864	10.18	6.49	

Summary of technical potential study results (from September AG meeting)

Estimate

### Initial Run: Economic Potential Results

Commercial



Residential



Based on discounted cash flow analysis that includes:

- System cost and expected maintenance
- Retail bill savings from avoided electricity consumption
- Whether the system is eligible for incentives, rebates, or avoided tax

Technical Potential

Deploymen Estimate

### Initial Run: Total Economic Potential



Economic potential **grows slightly** due to:

- Decline in PV installation costs
- Offset by declining value due to increased deployment

Technical Potential Economic Potential Deployment Estimate

### Where Are We on the Adoption Curve?



• Technology adoption shows characteristic S-curve driven by innovators & imitators

• Different technologies show unique adoption: 60% for dishwashers, 100% for refrigerators;

different thresholds for when adoption 'takes off'

• No technology is a perfect analog

Technical Potential Economic Potential

### Initial Run: Rooftop Solar Deployment Estimates



Note:

Further work needed to address whether and how these targets could be achievable in practice (e.g., constructability)

Calibration of this part of the model still underway

*Conversations about solar adoption on multi-family buildings are ongoing* 

Technical Potential Economi Potentia

### Local Solar + Storage: Coming in March AG Presentation

- Technical potential for local solar (ground-mount and car ports) and storage
- Deployment estimate for customer-adopted storage
- Continued refinement of assumptions

### Questions?



The Los Angeles 100% Renewable Energy Study